To Accreditation Council of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care

#### REPORT

### OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME 7M10104 - "PHARMACY" OF NJSC "MEDICAL UNIVERSITY OF KARAGANDA" FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS OF ACCREDITATION OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES OF THE MASTER SPECIALTIES IN HEALTH CARE

external expert evaluation period: <u>April 27-29, 2022</u>

Karaganda, 2022

ЕСАQА\_Евразийский центр аккредитации и обеспечения качества образования и здравоохранения

### TABLE OF CONTENTS

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	4
2.1.	Presentation of the accredited organization and educational programme in the	4
	specialty of the master's degree 7M110104 - "Pharmacy"	
2.2.	Information on previous accreditation	6
2.3.	Conclusion on the results of the review of the report on the self-assessment of	6
	the educational programme in the specialty of the master's degree 7M110104 -	
	"Pharmacy" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of educational	
	programmes of the specialties of the master's degree in health care and	
	conclusions	
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	7
4.	Results of the survey of teachers and undergraduates	13
5.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results	18
	of an external assessment of the Master's degree programme 7M110104 -	
	Pharmacy	20
6.	Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme in the	30
7	specialty of the master's degree 7M110104 - "Pharmacy"	21
7.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	31
	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria of external evaluation and educational programme of master's degree programme in the specialty of master's degree	32
	7M110104 - "Pharmacy"	
	Attachment 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	33
	Attachment 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation Attachment 3. Organization Visit programme	33
	Attachment 5. Organization visit programme	

### List of symbols and abbreviations

Abbreviation	Designation
NJSC "MUK"	Non-profit joint-stock company "Medical University of
	Karaganda"
EP	Educational programme
RoK	Republic of Kazakhstan
SCES	State compulsory standard of education
TS	Teaching staff
AC	Academic Council
DAW	Department of Academic Work
DIID	Department of Informatization and Infrastructure Development
HRDM	Human Resources Department Management
IEP	Individual Educational Plan
BD	Basic disciplines
PD	Profile disciplines
CC	Component of Choice
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
RW	Research work
MRW	Master's Research work
WC	Work Curriculum
AIS	Automated Information System
QMS	Quality Management System
SQAS	Commission for Quality Assurance of educational programmes of
	the school
PD	Persons with disabilities
SSC	Student Service Center
JSC IR&PH	Joint-Stock Company International Scientific and Industrial
	Holding
JD	Job descriptions
DLT	Distance learning technologies
PGE	Postgraduate education
AMP	Administrative and managerial staff
EMCD	Educational and methodological complex of the discipline

#### 1. Composition of the external expert commission

In accordance with the ECAQA Order <u>No. 14</u> of April 13, 2022, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an educational programme for the specialty of the Master's degree programme 7M110104 - "Pharmacy" in the period of April 27-29, 2022, as follows:

order	Status as part	Full name	Regalia, position, place of work/place		
N⁰	of EEC		of study, course, specialty		
1	chairperson	KAUYSHEVA ALMAGUL AMANGELDIEVNA	candidate of Medical Sciences, Vice- Rector for Educational and Scientific Activities of the Kazakhstan Medical University "KSPH", Accredited Independent Expert on the Assessment of the Quality of Medical Services, Deputy Chairperson of the Board of the "Kazakhstan Alliance of Medical Organizations" RPO.		
2	Foreign Expert	RAKHIMOV BAHODIR BAHTIYOR SHULLI	doctor of Medical Sciences, Sanitary Doctor, Hygienist and Epidemiologist, Assistant of the School of Public Health of the Tashkent Medical Academy, Researcher of the Koryo University		
3	Kazakh Academic Expert	OSTENOVA GULBARAM OMARGAZIEVA	ph.D., Professor, Head of the Department of Pharmaceutical Technology, Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University		
4	Kazakh Academic Expert	TULEUTAEVA RAYKHAN ESENZHANOVNA	candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Pharmacology and Evidence-Based Medicine, "Semey Medical University" NJSC		
5	Employers' representative	EKATERINA KAMYLEVNA PAVLOVA	senior Provider, Paracelsus LLP, Paracelsus Pharmacy Network		
6	Representative of undergraduates	MAHMOUD NAZERKE SEIDUALIKYZY	Graduate student of the first year of study in the specialty "Pharmacy" of "Medical University of Astana" NJSC		

The observer for ECAQA is Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The work of the ECAQA was carried out in accordance with the Regulation of EEC (Order of the Director General of ECAQA No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The ECAQA report contains an assessment of the educational programme in the specialty 7M110104 - "Pharmacy" for compliance with the Standards for the accreditation of educational programmes of the specialties of the master's degree in health care and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the ECAQA for further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the aforementioned educational programme of the master's degree 7M110104 - "Pharmacy" and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

#### 2. General part of the final report

# 2.1 Presentation of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" and the educational programme in the specialty of the Master 7M110104 - "Pharmacy"

Organization name, legal form of ownership, BIN	Karaganda University of Medicine » NJSC.
	Non-commercial joint-stock company "Medical University of Karaganda"
	"Karaganda Medical University" non-commercial joint-stock company.
Full name of the chief executive officer	Turmukhambetova Anar Akylbekovna acting Chairperson of the Management Board-Rector
Created in	
Location and contact details	Republic of Kazakhstan, Karaganda region, karaganda, str. Gogol, 40, 100008
State license for educational activities in the residency (date, number)	No. KZ32LAA00016018, issued on 06.05.2019
Information on branches, subsidiaries (if any)	-
Year of implementation of the accredited educational programme (EP)	2013
Duration of training	2
Total number of graduates since the beginning of EP implementation	16
The number of undergraduates in EP since the beginning of the current year	4
Full-time trainers/	51/39, degree 100%
Combiners involved in the implementation of EP, incl. % of	
degree	

One of the leading universities in the country providing postgraduate training in the field of Pharmacy is NJSC "MUK", which is carried out on the basis of a state license. Training of specialists in the Master's degree programme 6M110400 - "Pharmacy" is carried out in accordance with the Mission of the University - training of professionals in the field of applied medical and pharmaceutical sciences and pharmaceutical practice that meet the requirements of the national health care system and international standards. Graduates of MUK and EP are positioned as highly professional specialists, in demand and competitive in the modern labor market.

The self-assessment of the educational programme of the master's degree programme in the specialty 6M110400 - "Pharmacy" was carried out within the framework of the regulatory documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan and was based on the results of work for the period 2019 - 2021.

As part of the accreditation of the EP, the external audit was carried out in accordance with the approved programme of external audit on April 27-29, 2022. The expert group visited the bases of master's degree practices: JSC IR&PH "Phytochemistry", Laboratory of the School of Pharmacy of NJSC "MUK", microbiological laboratories, Institute of Public Health and Professional Health,

ЕСАQА Евразийский центр аккредитации и обеспечения качества образования и здравоохранения

Department of the School of Pharmacy. Also, as part of the visit to the bases, there was a visit to practical classes, during which undergraduates demonstrated their theoretical training, showed their achievements and practical skills learned during the implementation of the educational programme.

During the meeting and interviews with undergraduates, graduates and employers, the EEC received a high appreciation from all participants in the educational process, both in terms of teaching and assessment methods, and in terms of mastering their competencies by undergraduates. Graduates of the Master's degree programme 6M110400 - "Pharmacy" are in demand in the labor market, have the opportunity to continue their studies in the doctorate, also in the walls of the MUK.

The basis of success in training is the teaching staff, which is represented by 22 academics and members – correspondents of the National Academy of Sciences, the Academy of Medical Sciences, the Academy of Military Sciences, the National Academy of Natural Sciences of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Russian Academy of Natural Sciences, the International Academy of Informatization, the Eurasian International Academy of Sciences, 56 Doctors of Sciences, 31 Doctors of PhD, 169 Candidates of Sciences and 129 specialists with a master's degree.

Having carried out the first enrolment in the EP in 2013, 16 masters in the specialty Pharmacy have been graduated to date (by year: in 2015 - 4, in 2016 - 3, in 2017 - 2, in 2019 - 3, in 2020 - 4).

The state of the material and technical base for the training of specialists in the field of Pharmacy is important and remarkable. Thus, there are 7 educational buildings with classrooms equipped with interactive equipment to varying degrees, a good scientific library with reading rooms and an electronic library hall, a Center for Simulation Technologies with high-tech simulators and dummies. The great advantage of the university is the presence of its own Research Center and Laboratory for collective use, Research Sanitary and Hygienic Laboratory, 6 dormitories, 57 clinical bases, 476 bases for professional practice in the Republic of Kazakhstan and abroad, Medical University Clinic, Dental Clinic, student sports and health camps.

MUK NJSC was one of the first in the country to successfully pass certification of the quality management system of the University of Educational, Scientific and Clinical Activities in 2005 for compliance with the requirements of the International Standard ISO 9001 by the certification body NQA – UK (UK), NQA – Russia. In 2015, the university was certified in SGS (Switzerland), and recertified in 2020 in the Certification Association "Russian Register" (Russia).

NJSC "MUK" is a part of the Directories of the Avicenna Medical Schools of WHO and WFMO, the Magna Charta of Universities (MCU), the Association for Medical Education in Europe (AMEE), the Association for the Study of Medical Education (ASME), the Association for Medical Education in Asia (AMEA), the Organization for the protection of PhD in Biomedicine and Healthcare in the European NJSC (ORPHEUS), the Organization of University Mobility in Asia and the Pacific (UMAP), the International Academy for the Development of Education (IAED), the Association of the Barcelona Graduate School of Management (GSMB), the European Association of Universities (EUA).

In the national rankings, the university occupies a leading position in various Bachelor's programmes. According to the Master's degree programme, there were no ratings at the national level.

According to the requirements of the time, the training of students is carried out in Kazakh and Russian. Form of study – full-time, daytime.

Members of the EEC held interviews with the Acting President of the Management Boardrector of MUK NJSC, employees of the Student Service Center, the Department of Academic Work, the Dean of the School of Pharmacy and the Deputy Dean of the Research School, heads of various structural units of the University, teaching staff, undergraduates, graduates and employers. In a personal meeting and interview, the members of the EEC had no doubt that both the educational process and the achievement of all competencies by undergraduates, corresponds to the stated mission, vision of the University and is attractive to all participants in the educational process.

#### 2.2. Information on previous accreditation

Accreditation of EP 7M110104 - "Pharmacy" for the first time successfully passed in 2016 at the IQAA Agency, valid until 24.09.2021.

# 2.3 Conclusion on the results of the review of the report on the self-assessment of EP 7M110104 - "Pharmacy" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of educational programmes of the specialties of the master's degree in health care and conclusions.

The self-assessment report EP 7M110104 - "Pharmacy" (hereinafter – the report) is presented on <u>90</u> pages of the main text, electronic versions of <u>24</u> documents located at <u>https://www.qmu.edu.kz/media/qmudoc.pdf</u>.

The report is characterized by the completeness of responses to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the organization of education by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. A cover letter signed by Anar Akylbekovna Turmukhambetova, Acting Chairperson of the Management Board, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, confirming the reliability of quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report, is attached to the report.

The report contains a list of <u>8</u> members of the internal self-assessment commission, indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme – Yernazarova Madina Aynullaevna, Chief Specialist of the Department of Strategic Development and Quality Management. The self-assessment of the Master's degree programme 7M10104- "Pharmacy" was carried out on the basis of the order of the head No. 61 dated 14.02.2022 "On approval of the composition of the internal

commission".

The report was reviewed by the accreditation expert: Tulentayeva R.E., and the reviews noted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes, including the following:

1       no.         2       1) To conclude contracts with multidisciplinary clinics, production bases, etc. for the organization of internship for undergraduates of EP 7M10104 – "Pharmacy".         2) Increase academic mobility of undergraduates, opportunities for publications and participation in international conferences and forums.         3       In the course of the implementation of the EP for the formative assessment or undergraduates, introduce the portfolio method.         4       no.         5       1) Strengthen the language competencies of teaching staff and students for wide integration into the international space.         2) Establish international cooperation, academic mobility of faculty and students in the master's degree programme.         6       no.         7       To expand the partnership with the organizations of practical pharmacy for internships         8       no.	Q4 1 1			
2       1) To conclude contracts with multidisciplinary clinics, production bases, etc. for the organization of internship for undergraduates of EP 7M10104 – "Pharmacy".         2) Increase academic mobility of undergraduates, opportunities for publications and participation in international conferences and forums.         3       In the course of the implementation of the EP for the formative assessment or undergraduates, introduce the portfolio method.         4       no.         5       1) Strengthen the language competencies of teaching staff and students for wide integration into the international space.         2) Establish international cooperation, academic mobility of faculty and students in the master's degree programme.         6       no.         7       To expand the partnership with the organizations of practical pharmacy for internships         8       no.         9       Due to the need of the society to attract more applicants for training, including at the	Standards	Reviewer (s) Recommendations		
organization of internship for undergraduates of EP 7M10104 – "Pharmacy".         2) Increase academic mobility of undergraduates, opportunities for publications and participation in international conferences and forums.         3       In the course of the implementation of the EP for the formative assessment or undergraduates, introduce the portfolio method.         4       no.         5       1) Strengthen the language competencies of teaching staff and students for wide integration into the international space.         2) Establish international cooperation, academic mobility of faculty and students in the master's degree programme.         6       no.         7       To expand the partnership with the organizations of practical pharmacy for internships         8       no.         9       Due to the need of the society to attract more applicants for training, including at the	1	no.		
<ul> <li>2) Increase academic mobility of undergraduates, opportunities for publications and participation in international conferences and forums.</li> <li>3 In the course of the implementation of the EP for the formative assessment or undergraduates, introduce the portfolio method.</li> <li>4 no.</li> <li>5 1) Strengthen the language competencies of teaching staff and students for wide integration into the international space.</li> <li>2) Establish international cooperation, academic mobility of faculty and students in the master's degree programme.</li> <li>6 no.</li> <li>7 To expand the partnership with the organizations of practical pharmacy for internships</li> <li>8 no.</li> <li>9 Due to the need of the society to attract more applicants for training, including at the</li> </ul>	2	1) To conclude contracts with multidisciplinary clinics, production bases, etc. for the		
a       participation in international conferences and forums.         3       In the course of the implementation of the EP for the formative assessment or undergraduates, introduce the portfolio method.         4       no.         5       1) Strengthen the language competencies of teaching staff and students for wide integration into the international space.         2) Establish international cooperation, academic mobility of faculty and students in the master's degree programme.         6       no.         7       To expand the partnership with the organizations of practical pharmacy for internships         8       no.         9       Due to the need of the society to attract more applicants for training, including at the		organization of internship for undergraduates of EP 7M10104 – "Pharmacy".		
3       In the course of the implementation of the EP for the formative assessment or undergraduates, introduce the portfolio method.         4       no.         5       1) Strengthen the language competencies of teaching staff and students for wide integration into the international space.         2) Establish international cooperation, academic mobility of faculty and students in the master's degree programme.         6       no.         7       To expand the partnership with the organizations of practical pharmacy for internships         8       no.         9       Due to the need of the society to attract more applicants for training, including at the		2) Increase academic mobility of undergraduates, opportunities for publications and		
3       In the course of the implementation of the EP for the formative assessment or undergraduates, introduce the portfolio method.         4       no.         5       1) Strengthen the language competencies of teaching staff and students for wide integration into the international space.         2) Establish international cooperation, academic mobility of faculty and students in the master's degree programme.         6       no.         7       To expand the partnership with the organizations of practical pharmacy for internships         8       no.         9       Due to the need of the society to attract more applicants for training, including at the		participation in international conferences and forums.		
undergraduates, introduce the portfolio method.         4       no.         5       1) Strengthen the language competencies of teaching staff and students for wide integration into the international space.         2) Establish international cooperation, academic mobility of faculty and students in the master's degree programme.         6       no.         7       To expand the partnership with the organizations of practical pharmacy for internships         8       no.         9       Due to the need of the society to attract more applicants for training, including at the				
4       no.         5       1) Strengthen the language competencies of teaching staff and students for wide integration into the international space.         2) Establish international cooperation, academic mobility of faculty and students in the master's degree programme.         6       no.         7       To expand the partnership with the organizations of practical pharmacy for internships         8       no.         9       Due to the need of the society to attract more applicants for training, including at the	3	In the course of the implementation of the EP for the formative assessment of		
5       1) Strengthen the language competencies of teaching staff and students for wide integration into the international space.         2) Establish international cooperation, academic mobility of faculty and students in the master's degree programme.         6       no.         7       To expand the partnership with the organizations of practical pharmacy for internships         8       no.         9       Due to the need of the society to attract more applicants for training, including at the		undergraduates, introduce the portfolio method.		
integration into the international space.         2) Establish international cooperation, academic mobility of faculty and students in the master's degree programme.         6       no.         7       To expand the partnership with the organizations of practical pharmacy for internships         8       no.         9       Due to the need of the society to attract more applicants for training, including at the	4	no.		
integration into the international space.         2) Establish international cooperation, academic mobility of faculty and students in the master's degree programme.         6       no.         7       To expand the partnership with the organizations of practical pharmacy for internships         8       no.         9       Due to the need of the society to attract more applicants for training, including at the	5 1) Strengthen the language competencies of teaching staff and stude			
<ul> <li>2) Establish international cooperation, academic mobility of faculty and students in the master's degree programme.</li> <li>6 no.</li> <li>7 To expand the partnership with the organizations of practical pharmacy for internships</li> <li>8 no.</li> <li>9 Due to the need of the society to attract more applicants for training, including at the</li> </ul>				
master's degree programme.         6       no.         7       To expand the partnership with the organizations of practical pharmacy for internships         8       no.         9       Due to the need of the society to attract more applicants for training, including at the		2) Establish international cooperation, academic mobility of faculty and students in the		
<ul> <li>To expand the partnership with the organizations of practical pharmacy for internships</li> <li>no.</li> <li>9 Due to the need of the society to attract more applicants for training, including at the</li> </ul>		master's degree programme.		
<ul> <li>To expand the partnership with the organizations of practical pharmacy for internships</li> <li>no.</li> <li>9 Due to the need of the society to attract more applicants for training, including at the</li> </ul>				
8     no.       9     Due to the need of the society to attract more applicants for training, including at the	6	no.		
9 Due to the need of the society to attract more applicants for training, including at the	7	To expand the partnership with the organizations of practical pharmacy for internships		
9 Due to the need of the society to attract more applicants for training, including at the				
	8	no.		
expense of own funds of students	9	Due to the need of the society to attract more applicants for training, including at the		
		expense of own funds of students		

Thus, in the process of feedback from the representative of the educational organization, experts received answers to the questions that arose and the self-assessment report was amended accordingly and additions were made to the recommendations of the reviewers.

All standards include the real practice of NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" for the preparation of masters in the specialty 7M10104- "Technology of pharmaceutical production", taking into account the beginning of admission of students in <u>2013</u>, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of knowledge and skills assessment, material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for development and improvement.

The report is submitted to ECAQA in a completed form, with correction of the data on the above recommendations, written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criterion of standards, tables and contain references in the text and have end-to-end numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure, the external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during the visit to the educational institution, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

#### 3. External expert evaluation assessment

External expert work in the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme in the specialty of the Master's degree 7M10104- "Pharmacy" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director General of the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance of Education and Health" No.5 dated February 17, 2017) and in accordance with the programme approved by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. dated April 13, 2022 No 14 and agreed with Turmukhambetov A.A., Acting Chairperson of the Management Board-Rector. Dates of the visit to the organization: April 27-29, 2022.

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the Programme), which is contained in the documentation of the accreditation center and in Attachment 3 to this report. The programme is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

The participation of a foreign expert Rakhimov Bakhodir Bakhtiyor Shugli is provided on the zoom platform (video recordings are archived in the accreditation body).

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

• interview with management and administrative staff –4 people in total;

- interviews with undergraduates a total of <u>12</u> people,
- study of the website https://www.qmu.edu.kz/en/;
- interviewing <u>16 employees</u>, <u>12</u> teachers;
- questionnaires of teachers and undergraduates <u>12</u> and 17, respectively;
- observation of undergraduate studies: attendance at practical classes on chemistry and technology of phyto preparations and biopharmaceutics, prospects for the technology of dosage forms;
- review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards: 5 practice/clinical engagement bases were visited, including JSC IR&PH "Phytochemistry",

Laboratories of the School of Pharmacy of the NJSC "MUK", Microbiological Laboratory at the Department of Biomedicine, Laboratories of the School of Pharmacy (vivarium), Institute of Public Health and Occupational Health, where training on the educational programme is conducted with the participation of 6 full-time teachers / 2 part-time employees;

• study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of <u>16</u> units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the units (the list of studied documents is in Attachment 2).

The staff of the accredited organization ensures the presence of all persons indicated in the visiting programme and according to the lists of interviews and interviews (Table 1).

# Table 1 -Information about the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with members of the EEC

Nº	Full name	Job Title		
1	Atazhanova Gayane	Research Professor, School of Pharmacy		
	Abdulkhakimovna			
2	Lenina Mikhailovna Vlasova	Associate Professor, School of Pharmacy		
3	Ivasenko Svetlana Aleksandrovna	Research Professor, School of Pharmacy		
4	Figurinene Irina Vladislavovna	Associate Professor, School of Pharmacy		
5	Dmitry Anatolyevich Klyuev	RC, Director		
6	Murzalieva Gulnara Tleukhanovna	Associate Professor, School of Pharmacy		
7	Kozhalova Bibimaryam Zakirovna	Associate Professor, School of Pharmacy		
8	Nurmagambetov Zhangeldy	Associate Professor, School of Pharmacy		
	Seitovich			
9	Dauletkalieva Zhania Abayevna	Dean, School of Public Health and Biomedicine		
10	Kalishev Marat Kalishev	Professor, School of Public Health and Biomedicine		
11	Omarova Alois Oralovna	Associate Professor, School of Public Health and		
		Biomedicine		
12	Akhmetova Svetlana Vladimirovna	Acting Professor, School of Public Health and		
		Biomedicine		

# Table 2 -Information about the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with members of the EEC

N⁰	Full name	Job Title
1	Bekisheva Kamilla Khafizovna	Technology of Pharmaceutical Production", 2nd
		year
2	Kurmantayeva Gulnisa	Technology of Pharmaceutical Production", 2nd
	Kolbashevna,	year
3	Mustafin Marlen Beissenovich	Technology of Pharmaceutical Production", 2nd year
4	Savronova Dilnaz Shakhratkyzy	Technology of Pharmaceutical Production", 2nd year
5	Baigenzhina Aida Baikuanyshevna	Technology of Pharmaceutical Production", 1 course
6	Esquermesova Kundyz Alimbaevna	Technology of Pharmaceutical Production", 1 course
7	Vladimir Vitalyevich Kazantsev	Technology of Pharmaceutical Production", 1

		course	
8	Mukhametkanova Tamila Maratovna	Pharmaceutical production technology ", 1st year of	
		pharmaceutical production"	
9	Esedova Aizhan Mukhydovna	Technology of Pharmaceutical Production", 1	
		course	
10	Shatalova Ekaterina Gennadievna	Pharmacy, 1st year	
11	Baishagirova Gulbanu Bazarbayevna	Pharmacy, 1st year	
12	Raiymbekova Janel Altynbekkyzy	Pharmacy, 1st year	

Thus, when implementing the activities of the programme, namely, according to the results of the interview with the Acting Chairperson of the Board-Rector of the NJSC "MUK", Vice-Rector for Strategic Development and Science Turmukhambetova A.A., Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs Riklefs V.P., members of the Senate of the University, in an interview with undergraduates and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **standard 1** was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the organization and the main goals of the educational programme, took part in the formation of proposals for the formulation of the mission, while the content of strategic documents was brought to the attention of doctoral candidates through the website, social networks, information letters to medical and scientific organizations. From interviews with doctoral students, it was found that before the start of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organization, tell where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, training bases. This indicates compliance with **Standard 2** in terms of adapting training to the needs of masters.

The organization's documents contain work programmes, EMCD, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, independent work. Compliance with the SCES and standard requirements has been established. Attending the practical lesson on the topic "Chemical composition of vegetable raw materials and methods of its research", the volume of 6 hours, the experts received convincing data that the training is carried out according to the plan, before the beginning of the lesson the undergraduates answer the tests, receive feedback from the teacher, have the opportunity to improve the skill of extracting biologically active substances from vegetable raw materials. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, since the experts studied the code of ethics and during the interview, the residents replied that they were informed about the content of this document.

The scientific component in the training of undergraduates was studied, while the following evidence was obtained for the performance of research work by undergraduates.

While attending a practical lesson on the topic "Chemical composition of vegetable raw materials and methods of their research", in the amount of 6 hours and conversation with undergraduates, experts saw that the organization contributes to the development of scientific, practical and pedagogical competencies of future masters. At the same time, undergraduates develop and deepen their theoretical knowledge obtained before entering the master's programme, develop communication skills, in particular the ability to adapt and improve their scientific and cultural level.

The analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in advisory disciplines are taken into account, additions are made to the bibliography of the EMCD and syllabuses, and teachers apply them in classes.

The study of control and measuring tools (150 tests, 50 tasks) showed that the organization has implemented a proper evaluation policy that allows for a comprehensive assessment of the educational achievements of undergraduates. During the interview, the masters told about the grading forms, formative and summative grades of the master's student and that they were satisfied with everything. They also receive regular feedback from teachers and supervisors.

Approaches in the scientific management of undergraduates demonstrate the following, the head together with undergraduates determines the topic, goals and objectives of the master's thesis, provides the necessary conditions for the implementation of the dissertation.

The system of appealing the results of the assessment is reflected in the document "Academic Policy", but due to the small number of students in the master's degree and the high level of training during the work of the organization of education, there were no precedents for appeal. Thus, compliance with standard 3 has been established.

During the visit to the organization and during the interview with an employee of Bukeeva Aliya Satybaldievna, Head of the Department of Strategic Development and Quality Management, the commission made sure that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers/research managers and employees, and includes such documents as annual operational plans, annual reports, regulations of divisions, contracts with teachers and undergraduates, and educational and methodological documentation (work programme, work curricula, syllabuses, journals), evaluation tools (checklists, statements), certificates and certificates. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the documents necessary for undergraduates "Policy in the field of quality assurance of the educational process", "Rules of the rating system for assessing student performance", Conducting interim certification, the Code of Academic Integrity and information on the results of examinations, which is regularly updated. This information was obtained during an interview with Loseva Irina Viktorovna, Dean of the School of Pharmacy.

The conversation with Bokaeva Asemkul Bakytzhanovna, Deputy Dean of the Research School included such issues as the creation of conditions for the performance of scientific and research work by undergraduates and allowed experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of clinical/production bases for teaching (a total of 4 such teachers), about the strategy and tactics of recruiting undergraduates for this specialty, the information security of the educational programme, as well as to identify problems in the management and development of human resources, since most part-time teachers do not know teaching methods.

The formation of a pool of scientific managers is carried out in accordance with the indicators of scientific activity of the teaching staff.

Interviews with 12 full-time teachers showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of education, depending on the specific base (admission of undergraduates to equipment and office equipment for the set of material for the thesis, time for maintaining medical records, independent work). Experts received answers about the programme of professional development of teachers, financing of this training, availability at teachers of certification on methods of teaching.

On the same day, experts studied materials on the admission of residents and the selection of teachers and established compliance with standard 4.

In order to verify the data of Standard 5, external experts received an opinion on personnel policy and approaches to the development of teachers' pedagogical competence, motivation to work with undergraduates, implementation of a system of scientific leadership (<u>6</u> people in total). Experts found that undergraduates initiate research topics for the dissertation research, and scientific leaders regularly consult and stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature, medical documentation

During visits to clinical/production bases, where experts conducted a survey of resources, their compliance with training programmes, accessibility for teachers and undergraduates, as far as this equipment is modern and meets the needs of students and practical health/business. Experts obtained evidence of compliance with Standard 6, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report and to obtain evidence on the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with residents in the specialty. Experts asked questions about the satisfaction with the training, the adequacy of time for the supervision of patients, work with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and the qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for students in need, participation in scientific work, the availability of a resource of international databases of professional literature. The skills of using these resources were assessed when visiting the Scientific Laboratory, JSC Phytochemistry. In general, undergraduates are satisfied with the training and scientific guidance, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, as they believe that the organization of education has good resources, image and international relations, at the same time, the wishes of undergraduates include participation in academic mobility and participation in scientific forums in the field of pharmacy. Thus, the experts received evidence of the implementation of Standard 6 during their visits to the practice bases and clinic.

The master students showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering the questions of external experts, demonstrated their judgment on the organization of training and providing conditions for the performance of the dissertation research, the submission of a thesis for defense, assessment of their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in the activities of the organization of education, funding. Experts studied the documents of doctoral students (portfolio, evaluation results, questionnaire results, abstracts, dissertations).

Interviews with 8 employers were conducted in a face-to-face mode and included such issues as: knowledge of the mission of the university, participation in the development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of undergraduates, participation in the training of undergraduates, providing the supervising department and undergraduates with the necessary resources for scientific and practical training and the formation of critical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments, full employment of graduates upon completion of a master's degree, etc.

The review of the material and technical base and information and communication resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities. Thus, the clinical and production bases of Phytochemistry Holding, Amanat LLP and the Institute of Occupational Diseases, and employees of the organization of education provide collegial and ethical relations with personnel, management of the production and clinical base to achieve the final results of undergraduates. Sufficient data has been provided for the thesis kit, modern equipment is available to the graduate student, and staff who serve as both teachers and supervisors are responsible for high-quality ethical and ethical teaching. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the master receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during the training.

The following positive aspects can be noted in the process of interviews with the AMP and the teaching staff of the Ministry of Education and Science: each School has a quality assurance commission, its own School Council and its own KPIs. The academic policy is in full compliance with WLME. If necessary, the EP is updated annually, the EEC is revised. The motivating factor is the certification of teaching staff by categories and scientific achievements.

However, the TS noted that the gap in the number of undergraduate grants between the specialties of TPP and Pharmacy, 49 and 12, respectively, is too large, which does not quite meet the needs of practical health care. During the reporting period, there were 4 places in the Master's degree programme for Pharmaceuticals and 6 places for TPP. After studying the materials on the admission of undergraduates and the selection of teaching staff, EEC established compliance with Standard 4.

The experts made sure that the heads of undergraduates initiate research topics for students, assist in providing resources, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature, work with databases that are available for each undergraduate. Master's students demonstrated their commitment to the organization of education, during the interviews they were active in answering the questions of external experts, showed their position in the assessment of the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in research.

The disciplines of Phytochemistry, Phytopreparation Development, Pharmaceutical Management, Pharmaceutical Marketing and Improvement of the Drug Provision Mechanism were implemented taking into account feedback from graduates and employers.

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. The final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of the interview, questionnaires was held. EEC members started designing the final EEC report. The results of the external evaluation are summarized. Experts individually completed the "Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme in the specialty of Master's degree 7M10104-"Pharmacy" for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations on improving the educational programme were discussed and the Chairperson of Kauysheva Almagul Amangeldievna held a final open vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation period of 5 years.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all the necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the NEI "KRMU", the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the members of the EEC.

At the end of the programme of the visit, the chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the organization of education announced recommendations on the results of an external assessment within the framework of specialized accreditation.

**Conclusion:** the specialty 7M10104- "Pharmacy " of the Medical University of Karaganda complies with the requirements of the "Standard for accreditation of educational programmes of the master's degree programme of medical organizations of education" of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care.

#### 4. Results of the survey

An ECAQA observer conducted an online questionnaire at https://webanketa.com on 27-29 April 2022.

#### The survey of undergraduates includes 39 questions.

A total of 17 people responded (a total of 4 undergraduates for the current year).

To the question "I am" out of 17 respondents, 10 people (58.82%) answered the Master's student, 12 people (70.59%) answered "completely agree": "I will recommend studying in this educational institution to my friends, relatives", 4 people (23.53%) partially agree with the answer, and only 1 out of 17 (5.88%) respondents answered "doubt the answer".

On the question "Programme managers and teachers are aware of students' problems related to learning" 14 respondents (82.35%) were completely in agreement with the statement, 1 respondent (5.88%) answered "partially agree", "completely disagree" and "doubt the answer".

The question was asked about the involvement of students in advisory bodies: Programme managers and teachers involve students in the work of advisory bodies (methodological council, scientific council, committees of educational programmes), to which 15 respondents (88.24%) answered "yes, constantly", 1 person (5.88%) answered "doubtful with the answer" and "sometimes".

16 people (94.12%) noted full satisfaction with the conditions and equipment of classrooms, classrooms of this organization of education, 1 person (5.88%) was partially satisfied.

76.47% of respondents (13 people) fully confirmed by agreement the question that "In this organization of education conditions for rest and food of pupils (rooms for rest, benches/gazebos on the territory, a buffet-canteen) in breaks between occupations" are created, 4 people -23,53% partially agreed with the statement.

Also 76,47% of respondents (13 people) completely confirmed by agreement a question that "Office equipment (computers, laptops, printers) are available for students in classrooms and practice bases", 4 people -23,53% partially agreed with the statement.

Teachers provide students with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, 14 people (82.35%) fully agree with this question, 2 (11.76%) partially agree and 1 (5.88%) partially disagree with the statement.

In the organization of education there is access to the participation of students in research work - 16 (94.12%) respondents fully agreed with this, 1 (5.88%) was partially agreed.

Fifteen (88.24 per cent) of the respondents were fully satisfied with the resources and the Library Fund, while two (11.76 per cent) were partially satisfied.

14 people (82.35%) were fully satisfied with access to electronic educational resources, 3 (17.65%) were partially satisfied.

76.47% of respondents (13 people) are completely satisfied with the availability of medical services for students, 2 (11.76%) are partially satisfied.

In the question of Satisfaction with the activities of mentors, curators, scientific managers, 15 (88.24%) respondents were completely satisfied, 2 (11.76%) were partially satisfied.

On a question "Teachers and employees of the organization of education respectfully treat students" 15 (88,24%) respondents agree completely, 1 person (5,88%) gave the answer disagree and 1 respondent (5,88%) had no answer.

In the organization of education there are social programmes to support students, 14 people (82.35%) answered yes, I agree, 3 (17.65%) answered "have not heard about such programmes".

The presence of a career counselling service in the organization of education - 11 people (64.71%) confirmed, 4 (23.53%) did not hear about this, 2 (11.76%) doubted the answer.

In the organization of education, a system of independent education for students, residents, undergraduates, doctoral students and trainees was established. 14 people (82.35%) agreed completely, 2 (11.76%) partially agreed, 1 (5.88%) doubted the answer.

Evaluate the organization of clinical (practical) training, 11 (64.71%) respondents rated excellent, 4 (23.53%) good, 2 (11.76%) could not assess.

There is sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, clinical rounds, clinical reviews, assistance in operations, work in laboratories and in pharmaceutical production) - fully agreed with the statement of 16 (94.12%) respondents, 1 (5.88%) doubted with the answer.

I am satisfied with the schedule of classes in the disciplines of the educational programme - also fully agreed with the statement of 16 (94.12%) respondents, 1 (5.88%) partially agreed.

13 people (76.47%) are completely satisfied with the methods of assessment of knowledge and skills, 4 partially (23.53%).

Also, 13 people (76.47%) are completely satisfied that the content of the educational programme (list of disciplines) in the chosen specialty meets their expectations, 3 (17.65%) agreed partially and 1 (5.88%) disagreed.

Teachers in the classes use active and interactive methods of teaching, 15 people (88.24%) regularly responded, sometimes and rarely responded to 1 person (5.88%).

How often the teacher is late to the beginning of classes – there was no such answer 14 people (82,35%), 1 person (5,88%) answered sometimes, systematically and I don't know what to answer.

After completing the classes, does the teacher give you feedback (listen to your opinion, conduct a mini-questionnaire, work on errors), yes, constantly - 13 (76.47%) respondents answered, 2 people each (11.6%) answered sometimes and rarely.

For 13 people (76.47%), the teacher (mentor, curator) of this organization of education is an example as a professional doctor, a person (ethics, communications, appearance, speech), 1 (5.88%) completely disagrees with this, 3 noted that not all are teachers of this organization of education.

Sufficient number of patients for curation or assistance in operations - 9 (52.94%) are fully satisfied, 1 (5.88%) partially, 7 (41.18%) did not respond.

13 (76.47%) people wrote that they like to study in this organization of education, 4 (23.53%) partially agreed with this.

I am satisfied with the relationship with my fellow students, colleagues, medical staff, 14 people (82.35%) fully agree with this, 3 (17.65%) partially agree.

Did you personally experience a negative attitude of teachers? -14 people (82.35%) wrote no to this question, 1 person (5.88%) gave answers - "sometimes, deservedly", "yes, unfairly" and 1 questionnaire was unanswered.

Are you satisfied that you study in this organization of education?, yes, completely 13 (76.47%), 3 (17.65%) partially and no, disappointed answered 1 of the respondents (5.88%).

The accessibility of the organization of education for students was quite affordable for 16 people (94.12%) and not available for 1 (5.88%).

Are you currently engaged in research work?- 16 people (94.12%) answered yes, 1 (5.88%) answered that they do not want to engage in research.

Do you personally have printed works (articles, abstracts, reviews) published during your studies in this educational institution? – yes, one replied 1 (5.88%), 8 (47.06%) have more than one, 8 (47.06%) plan to publish in the near future.

In your opinion, this organization of education allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the specialty you have chosen? -15 (88.24%) are sure of this, 1 (5.88%) is not sure of this and cannot yet answer this question.

Are you satisfied with the organization of teaching - 14 (82.35%) completely yes, 2 (11.76%) partially and 1 (5.88%) doubted with the answer.

Your opinion on the work of the External Expert Commission on the accreditation of this educational institution? 13 (76.47%) of the respondents noted as positive, 4 (23.53%) doubted the answer.

Do you think that accreditation of an education organization or educational programmes is necessary? Yes 16 (94.12%), no 1 (5.88%).

Have managers and/or teachers involved you in preparations for institutional or specialized (programmatic) accreditation? 5 (29.41%) yes, when preparing the self-assessment report, 1 (5.88%) yes, to organize a meeting of external experts, 2 (11.76%) each answered yes, at all stages of preparation and yes, since I speak a foreign language.

Thus, the majority of students (from 76.47% and above) are completely satisfied with the organization and conduct of the educational process, social support, the availability of resources, and the material and technical base. Only 1% noted partial satisfaction in the survey and also a small proportion, 1% of respondents, found it difficult to answer.

**The teacher survey included 29 questionnaire questions.** In total 12 people answered, thus pedagogical experience till 5 years – 1 person (5,88%), till 10 years - 2 (16,67%), more than 10 years - 9 (7%).

6 people (50%) teachers Pharmacy /TPP (bachelor's degree), 1 each (8.33%) Management in PHC, Master's degree and other Bachelor's degree programmes, 2 each (16.67%) HE/Management in PHC, Doctoral and Master's degrees, other areas.

I am satisfied with the organization of the educational process in this educational institution – yes, 9 (75%) of the respondents said, 3 (25%) partially agreed with this statement.

In this organization of education ethics and subordination in the relations between colleagues, teachers, the management are observed, with it 10 (83,33%) respondents completely agree and 2 (16,67%) agree partially.

I am satisfied with the organization of work and workplace in this organization of education, 9 (75%) people fully agreed with this statement, 2 (16.67%) partially agreed and 1 (8.33%) partially "disagreed".

On the question in the questionnaire "There is an opportunity for career growth and

development of teacher's competencies" also 9 (75%) people fully agreed, 2 (16.67%) partially agreed and 1 (8.33%) partially disagreed.

In this organization of education, I have the opportunity to do scientific work and publish the results of research, with which 6 people (50%) completely agree, 5 (41.67%) partially agree and 1 (8.33%) partially disagree.

I am satisfied with the salary, 6 people (50%) agree completely, 1 (8.33%) disagree, 5(41.67%) answered "more yes than NOT".

10 people (83.33%) are satisfied with the work of HR personnel service, 2 (16.67%) are partially satisfied.

I studied at professional development courses (programmes) - during this year 7 (58.33%) respondents answered, 2 (16.67%) more than 5 years ago and I do not remember when it was, 1 (8.33%) respondent did not have an answer.

I believe that the discipline I teach is provided with sufficient resources (classrooms, equipment): 5 respondents (41.67%) agreed completely and partially, 1 (8.33%) completely disagreed and doubted the answer.

In this organization of education, I have the opportunity to realize myself as a professional in the specialty, 11 people (91.67%) fully agree with the answer, only 1 (8.33%) doubted with the answer.

I personally participated in the development of the educational programme in the discipline I teach: 6 (50%) answered yes, 2 (16.67%) no, did not participate, 4 (33.33%) answered that they were only electives.

Evaluate the timeliness of the implementation of applications for the purchase of methodological and didactic materials, office equipment, stationery to ensure the educational process in the organization - 7 (58.83%) noted timely implementation, 2 (16.67%) not timely, 1 (8.33%) answered a long wait for the implementation of the application, 2 (16.67%) noted "I have nothing to do with it".

On a question "The organization of education supports my participation in conferences (international, republican)" 5 people (41,67%) provides payment of a travel, business trip, registration fee, 2 (16,67%) payment of only travel, 1 (8,33%) doesn't pay any expenses, 4 (33,33%) answered "I don't address to the management on this occasion".

Students have free access to patients on the clinical bases of the university or to the resources of the practice bases (for pharmacy and healthcare) to improve their practical skills - 5 (41.67%) completely agree, 4 (33.33%) partially agree and 3 (25%) doubted the answer.

My publishing activity is assessed by me personally on a scale of 5 points (from 1 - low to 5 – high) – 7 (58.33%) marked "3", 3 (25%)- "4", 2 (16.67%) – "5".

Are there social support programmes for teachers implemented in the organization of education? -7 (58.33%) answered "yes, there are such programmes", 1 (8.33%) answered "no" and 2 (16.67%) did not know about it or doubted with the answer.

Are the heads of the organization listening to your opinion regarding the questions on the educational process, research, clinical work - 8 (66.67%) answered yes, systematically, 1 (8.33%) yes, sometimes and 3 (25%) no answer.

What teaching methods do you most often use in the process of teaching students (bachelor's, resident, master's, doctoral students)? 10 (83.33%) lectures, 8 (66.67%) Oral analysis of the topic of the lesson, 1 (8.33%) Rewriting of thematic information from monographs, 8 (66.67%) Problemoriented training, 7 (58.33%) Interactive training, 5 (41.67%) Performing abstracts, 6 (50%) Performing projects, coursework, 1 (8.33%) Practical classes on clinical skills in a training and clinical center, 9 (75%) Analysis of situational tasks, 2 (16.67%) Compilation and solution of cases, 7 (58.83%) Oral survey of students, 4 (33.33%) Test solution, 9 (75%) Work in small groups, 8 (66.67%) Written performance of tasks.

You believe that this questionnaire is useful for developing recommendations for improving

the key activities of your organization - 9 (75%) completely agree, 2 (16.67%) partially agree, 1 (8.33%) partially disagree.

Were you personally involved in activities to prepare for accreditation of educational programmes? yes, included in the internal self-assessment commission -6 (50%), yes, engaged in technical support before the meeting of the external expert commission -1 (8.33%), wrote sections of the self-assessment report 5 (41.67%), collected information for annexes to the self-assessment report 3 (25%), no, not involved in the preparation of the university for accreditation 3 (25%), I do not know what to answer -1 (8.33%)

Would you like to become an expert on accreditation of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care? Yes, I would like to answer 6 (50%), no, I am not interested in this question 5 (41.67%), I doubt with the answer 1 (8.33%)

In your opinion, the work of the external expert commission on accreditation can fully cover all issues related to the quality of the implementation of the university's educational programmes (several can be noted)? Yes, since the visit of the commission is preceded by the stage of selfassessment of the programme and writing a report -7 (58.33%), Yes, the commission investigates all the main processes of implementation of programmes 3 (25%), The programme of the visit of the commission is saturated and covers all key aspects of education 3 (25%), The programme of the commission includes interviews and interviews with stakeholders, allowing to draw conclusions about the quality of training 6 (50%), Everything depends on the professionalism and competence of accreditation experts 3 (25%), I doubt with the answer 3 (25%).

Which external accreditation expert activity (or activities) is most important and provides evidence of compliance with the Accreditation Standards? Interview with heads of educational programmes (heads of departments, deans) 1 (8.33%), Interview with representatives of employers 1 (8.33%), All the above 9 (75%), Doubtful with the answer 1 (8.33%).

The results of the survey in general demonstrate satisfaction with the educational process, the resources of the clinical base, the competencies of teachers, and also indicate the existence of centralized management of educational programmes.

#### 5. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the Medical University of Karaganda NJSC

### Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES

**Evidence of compliance:** 

The educational programme (EP) of the Master's degree programme 7M10104- "Pharmacy" was developed in full compliance with the State Mandatory Standard of Education of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan Order No.604 dated October 31, 2018. on the approval of the State Standard of Education for all levels of education, as well as the State Standard of Education for medical and pharmaceutical specialties, approved by the Order of the Acting Minister of Health and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 31, 2015 No. 647.

Master's Degree Programme 7M10104 - Pharmacy and its Mission were discussed at the meeting of the Scientific Council of MUK NJSC on April 25, 2019. Minutes No.9. Approved by the Chairperson of the Management Board - Rector of NJSC "MUK" dated April 25, 2019, considered at the meetings of the Academic Committee of the school (April 9, 2019, Minutes No.8), the Academic Council of NJSC "MUK" (April 23, 2019, Minutes No.6), the Academic Council of NJSC "MUK" (April 25, 2019, Minutes No.9), where all stakeholders participated: students, employers.

The mission of the Master's degree programme 7M10104 - "Pharmacy" is to train professionals in the field of applied medical and pharmaceutical sciences and pharmaceutical practice that meet the requirements of the national health care system and international standards.

Master's degree programme 7M10104 - "Pharmacy" corresponds to the national regulations, is coordinated with the National Qualifications Framework approved by the Joint Order of the Minister of Labor and Social Protection of the Republic of Kazakhstan No.373 dated September 24, 2012 and the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 444 dated September 28, 2012, the European Qualifications Framework based on the Dublin Descriptors, the State Standardized Qualifications Framework approved by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No.604 dated October 31, 2018, and also corresponds to the university-wide Mission.

The EP is implemented on the basis of the document "Regulations on the Master's Degree in NJSC "MUK". NJSC "MUK" management plays an important role in the adoption and approval of the quality assurance policy of the EP. Employees of the University undergo the procedure of acquaintance with the Quality Assurance Policy, in their daily activities they are guided by the provisions of the Policy, which was confirmed by the faculty during the interview.

The objectives and final results of the Master's Degree Programme 7M10104 - "Pharmacy" are aimed at demonstrating the knowledge of the theoretical foundations of all processes of pharmaceutical activity, the practice of scientific research on the development of medicines, pharmaceutical marketing and management.

The training results are harmonized with the descriptors and allow undergraduates to demonstrate a systematic understanding of the field of study, skill in terms of skills and knowledge of research methods; planning and implementation of scientific research that deserves to be published at the national or international level.

All stakeholders are involved in the quality assurance of the EP, the implementation of the mission and the final results of the training, taking into account the expectations and needs of the state.

During the visit, we received confirmation that the Master's Degree Programme 7M10104 - "Pharmacy" was developed by the working group of "MUK", the experts were representatives of employers.

The EP was discussed by the Council of the School of Public Health and Pharmacy, which includes representatives of employers (A.N. Zhabayeva, F.U. Makeyeva) and undergraduates, undergraduate student of 2 years of study Bekesheva K, undergraduate student of 2 years of study Kurmantayeva G.

When familiarizing themselves with the documentation, the experts were convinced that the content, scope and sequence of the Master's degree courses 7M10104 - "Pharmacy" strictly comply with the standards of education, the university independently forms a content component of the EP at the expense of the component of choice. The teaching staff and administrative structures of the university confirmed a high degree of academic freedom in the formation and implementation of EP. Teachers independently determine the forms of conducting classes, teaching methods, methods and forms of assessing the results of training, develop educational and methodological materials to ensure the educational process. The quality of the implementation of the EP is ensured by the work of the Commission for Quality Assurance of the School of Pharmacy, the teaching staff, the dean's office of the School of Pharmacy monitors changes in the EP, students and employers participate in surveys and work in advisory bodies.

The University is provided with a sufficient material and technical base for the implementation of the EP, there is a good equipment of educational and scientific laboratories, a rich library fund, a good information infrastructure of the university. The teaching staff of the School of Pharmacy determine the needs for providing the educational process with the necessary resources independently and draw up applications for the purchase of office equipment, laboratory equipment, consumables, educational literature and other information resources. The needs are discussed at the level of the School of Pharmacy. Academic freedom of undergraduates is achieved through the choice of elective disciplines of EP, direction of scientific research, scientific supervisor and consultant

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 5 standards: full – 5. *Standard 1: Implemented* 

#### Strengths:

- 1. Approved Quality, Mission, Vision and Values Policy of EP
- 2. The objectives and mission of the Master's Degree Programme 7M110104 "Pharmacy" correspond to the Development Plan and the mission of the university.

3. EP are developed on the basis of internal rules for the development and approval of educational programmes.

4. All parties involved in the development and evaluation of educational programmes: universities, employers, students, graduates.

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

#### **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROCESS**

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

Responsible teachers propose and implement teaching methods used on specific disciplines of the EP, these methods are considered at meetings of departments and schools involved in the implementation of the EP, are prescribed in the syllabuses of disciplines. The syllabuses of disciplines are annually revised in terms of content, teaching methods and forms of conducting classes, methods and forms of assessment, approved before the beginning of the academic year.

The Department of Informatization and Infrastructure Development (DIID) of MUK NJSC provides technical support to users for working with information systems. The training and scientific laboratories of the Ministry of Education and Science are also involved in the implementation of the National Research Institute of Mining and Metrology.

Educational materials for undergraduates are posted on the student portal of SharePoint University, You KMU video hosting, on the Moodle platform, in Platonus.

Practical training is not provided for EP Master's 7M10104 – "Pharmacy" in the conditions of multidisciplinary clinics, production bases, laboratories, medical organizations. Organizations of practice are used as bases for research practice, when the topic of the work of a master's degree student is related to a specific practical field of activity.

Master's topics are chosen by undergraduates voluntarily and are implemented under the guidance of experienced teachers, depending on the urgency of the problem. Scientific supervisors are approved at a meeting of the Senate. In the course of the research work of the master's student, all the necessary academic skills that make up his competence are formed, which are evaluated on the defense of master's theses (presented in the form of a formal assessment in the assessment sheets of the commission members of the final certification and informal assessment in the reviews of the supervisor, reviews of the external expert of the dissertation works).

The individual educational trajectory of each student is determined by the Individual Educational programme. The IEP is drawn up for the entire period of study and is stored in the master's student's personal file. The master's degree IEP includes the basic disciplines of the compulsory component, the basic and specialized disciplines of the elective component, as well as additional types of training, including the practice and research work of the master's degree (MRM).

The relevance of the content of the EP and the proposed disciplines is ensured by the content of the EP as a whole, its changes and the CED are discussed at meetings of the School Council with the participation of representatives of employers.

MUK NJSC independently establishes the list of disciplines of choice and the corresponding minimum amounts of loans, while taking into account the requests of employers and the needs of the labor market. The EP presents the developed matrix of competencies that a master's student must possess upon completion of training at each stage of the EP implementation.

Upon graduation of the specialty 7M10104 – "Pharmacy" graduates of the master's degree have the opportunity to continue their studies in the doctorate in the specialty 8D10104 – "Pharmacy" with a

term of study of 3 years. In addition, having received a master's degree in the field of "Pharmacy", graduates have a competitive advantage when participating in competitions to fill vacant positions of managers in pharmaceutical organizations of management bodies in the health care system of any level.

NJSC MUK creates favorable conditions for the implementation of RWM, ensuring the possibility of using a shared laboratory (accredited for compliance with the requirements of ST RK ISO 15189-2015 "Medical laboratories. Requirements for quality and competence"), research sanitary and hygienic laboratory (accredited in 2016 for compliance with the requirements of GOST ISO/IEC 17025-2019 "General requirements for the competence of testing and calibration laboratories") and vivarium. Students have free access to world information resources, authoritative scientific publications and publications in the field of medicine. The University Library is provided with 98.5% electronic resources and access to such resources as: Cochrane Library, Web of Science, Scopus, Science Direct and others.

The content of the EP, the list of competencies of graduates of the master's degree are discussed with representatives of employers (experts) during the development and writing of the educational programme 7M10104 – "Pharmacy". The content of the EP, the occupancy of the CED is discussed at the School Council every year, which also includes representatives of employers.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 21 standards (BS/IS): fully – 18/0, partially -1/2.

Standard 2: Implemented

#### Strengths:

1. The implementation of EP takes place within the framework of the approved Regulation on the management of educational programmes.

2. When implementing the EP, the balance between theoretical and practical activities is maintained throughout.

3. Assessment of the quality of EP is carried out through the mechanisms of internal assessment of the quality of the educational programme

4. Various teaching and learning methods are used and improved in the implementation of the EP

#### **Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- 1) To conclude contracts with multidisciplinary clinics, production bases, etc. for the organization of internship for undergraduates of EP 7M10104 "Pharmacy".
- 2)Increase academic mobility of undergraduates, opportunities for publications and participation in international conferences and forums.

#### Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENT LEARNING Evidence of compliance:

For undergraduates studying at the master's programme in the MUK, the forms used are Written examination (essays, tasks and other types of tasks), practical skills assessment (foreign language), academic certification and practice reports according to the MRW.

During the reporting period, there were no cases of failure to pass the exam, repeated passing of disciplines for the above reasons in the Master's degree programme "Pharmacy".

Assessment of the educational achievements of students in NJSC "MUK" is carried out on the basis of the provisions: Conducting interim certification, the Regulation on the final certification of students. The "<u>Regulations on the master's degree programme of NJSC</u>" MUK" (approved by the decision of the Board on January 11, 2021, Protocol No.1) defines and approves the principles, methods and practices used to evaluate undergraduates, including the criteria for evaluating scientific work.

After passing the interim assessment, grades of undergraduates are available in the personal account of the session platform. The master's student can see the result of the assessment of each exam

task, get acquainted with the examiner's comments and, if he/she disagrees with the assessment, submit this question for appeal.

For the master's student, the registrar office (DAW) and employees of the dean's office, assessments are available in the Platonus system. On the basis of the examination assessment, an examination sheet is formed to generate an overall final assessment for the discipline, which consists of an assessment of current performance (60%) and an examination (40%).

To comply with the principles of Academic Honesty, all written works of students are evaluated for originality through the Anti-Plagiarism system (student responses are downloaded automatically).

The final certification is carried out in order to determine the mastery by master's students of the disciplines provided for in the educational programme of the appropriate level of education and the assessment of final competencies. 12 credits are provided for the final certification of the SCES. The final certification is carried out in the form of writing and defending a master's thesis (project).

The adequacy of the teacher's assessment of the student's academic achievements is carried out according to the distribution curves of the grades set by him in accordance with the normal distribution (Bell Curve) in accordance with the approved criteria for assessing the student's learning outcomes based on the general principles of the Academic Integrity League (https://adaldyq.kz/documents). After the end of the academic period, the SQAS conducts an analysis of the quality of the assessment using a normal distribution diagram. The Academic Committee of the Senate conducts a critical analysis and can decide to cancel the results of the final control if the number of marks "excellent" exceeds 15% . In case of deviation from the SQAS norm in the right to initiate a personal hearing and analysis of the quality of teaching in specific disciplines at the Academic Committee of the Senate.

The student's academic rating (SAR) consists of the admission rating (AR, which is established by calculating the arithmetic mean of all current grades, and the final control rating (FCR): SAR = AR\*0.6 + FCR \* 0.4.

The summary score is expressed as a score according to the score-rating system and is used to form the transcript and the GPA of the graduate student.

Formative assessment at the university is carried out by assessing the student's progress. Progressive testing has been introduced in the bachelor's degree programme and is planned to be introduced in the master's degree programme.

The student's progress is also assessed on the basis of the results of the submission of semiannual reports of undergraduates, reports on practice, as well as on the results of the preparation and defense of master's thesis.

Methods and format for assessing current performance, and the final control of knowledge and skills of students corresponds to the objectives and content of the disciplines specified in the syllabuses. The syllabuses of each discipline are developed/updated each academic year.

Heads of educational programmes, teachers, SQAC, university administration receive feedback from students after passing the assessment procedure on students' satisfaction with the teaching methods used, the quality of the educational profession, the assessment procedure by conducting a survey (questionnaires, focus groups method, etc.). The results are considered at the meetings of departments/schools, are reflected in the minutes of the meetings.

*The conclusions of the EEC meet the criteria* of 10 standards: fully - 9, partially - 1, does not comply -0.

#### Strengths:

1. The assessment of undergraduates is carried out on the basis of approved principles, methods and practices;

2. A system of appeal is in place for the assessment of graduates;

3. There are mechanisms for internal and external assessment of the quality of EP implementation

4. The principles of academic honesty are observed when assessing the knowledge of undergraduates.

#### **Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1) In the course of the implementation of the EP for the formative assessment of undergraduates, introduce the portfolio method.

#### **Standard 4: STUDENTS**

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

In NJSC "MUK", the admission of students to the master's programme is carried out on the basis of the Admission Policy, which is part of the Academic Policy and the Regulation on the Admission Commission of NJSC "MUK" (Protocol No.1 of 10.06.2019. Decision of the Board). Master's students are admitted on the basis of their applications on a competitive basis on the basis of the results of comprehensive testing (CT).

In order to select applicants, vocational guidance work is carried out among potential graduates of undergraduate universities in suitable specialties. Meetings of university graduates with the dean, teachers, an advisor are held to explain the mission, tasks and prospects of studying in the Master's degree programme. Persons who have obtained the highest scores in the amount of entrance examinations in accordance with the annex to the Model Rules are enrolled in training under a state educational order. In the case of the same scores of competitive points, persons with the highest marks in the specialty receive the priority of enrollment, in the case of the same scores of the entrance examination in the specialty, persons with the highest marks in a foreign language receive the priority of enrollment. Then scientific achievements corresponding to the profile of the chosen specialty are taken into account.

NJSC MUK has a system for studying the employment, demand, career support and continuous professional development of graduates. The School of Pharmacy annually monitors the employment of graduates. To this end, graduates interact with employers directly in the course of their work at the departments of the NJSC "MUK".

Current performance is monitored by the dean's office in connection with the monthly certification of students. The forms of NJSC MUK provide for the maintenance by the staff of the school of the "Journal of information on the movement of the contingent" (F NJSC MUK 3/2-02/1), "Information on students who have academic debts, based on the results of the previous (summer or winter) examination session". According to the "Regulations on the School", its functions include the analysis of the academic achievements of students and graduates (report): attendance and performance during the semester, the results of intermediate and external assessment of academic achievements, appeals, the frequency of passing and failing examinations, the reasons for expulsion.

Master's degree programme 7M10104 - "Pharmacy" contains theoretical training, production practice, research work, final certification. The range and role of formative and summative tasks, the deadlines for the completion of tasks, are defined in the WC, academic calendars and in the syllabuses of disciplines.

Current monitoring of academic performance, intermediate and final certification of undergraduates is carried out by the university on the basis of the State Educational Standard.

Current control - systematic control over the attendance and performance of undergraduates, is carried out for each topic of the academic discipline and includes: control at classroom classes and on the independent work of the undergraduate with the teacher.

Final control (interim certification) - verification of academic achievements after completion of the discipline.

All types of assessments are recorded in an electronic journal on the Platonus platform by the teacher to whom the corresponding group is assigned. The current rating and final rating is calculated automatically by the programme.

Every month, teachers submit to the dean's office the assessment of undergraduates with a reflection of the problems of current problems of academic performance: missed classes, failed assignments, poor academic performance. The dean's office takes measures to eliminate the causes of failure with unqualified students - conversations, if necessary, decisions on disciplinary sanctions are made. The nature of the disciplinary punishment is determined by the Internal Regulations.

Evidence of master's students' achievement of research and other professional competencies is the successful completion of the final certification, which is carried out in the form of defense of a master's thesis (project). Requirements for the content, design and presentation of the thesis for defense are set out in the Regulations on the preparation of theses, master's and doctoral dissertations (Academic Policy).

The management of the university provides comprehensive support to undergraduates in the form of discounts for medical care in university clinics, for travel to university recreation areas; funds are allocated and support is provided to needy undergraduates. There is free internet access in all university and hostel buildings, services are provided without traffic restrictions. Each undergraduate student has his own individual identification number and password for logging in and working on the Internet. The university reading rooms are equipped with a sufficient number of computer equipment that graduate students can use to work with the library's electronic resources and to prepare assignments.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 12 standards: Fully -12. Standard 4: Implemented

#### Strengths:

1. The admission policy for undergraduates is reviewed at regular intervals and clearly articulated

2. The system of support for undergraduates is working

3. Master's students are involved in the management system of the EP through participation in the work of collegial bodies

4. Requirements for undergraduates regarding the fulfillment of all the requirements of the educational process and their progress are prescribed in the EP, academic policy and the "Regulations on the Master's Degree".

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none

### **Standard 5: STAFFING**

**Evidence of compliance:** 

To ensure the educational process within the framework of the Master's programme 7M10104 "Pharmacy", high-level professionals are involved. NJSC MUK implements personnel policy in strict accordance with the requirements of the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and internal regulations of the university.

Planning of the teaching load of teaching staff is carried out for the academic year. The mode of work is regulated by the schedule of classes, practices, etc. When calculating the load, they are based on the estimated planned number of students, the flow rate for each type of classes and the draft schedule as of the time of calculating the load. The calculation of the teaching load of the teaching staff is approved by the Vice-rector for Academic Work in June of each academic year. By August 25, a correction is carried out, taking into account the set of 1 course of all specialties, as well as taking into account possible changes in other parameters. In connection with the small contingent of master's students studying in the master's degree programme according to EP 7M10104 "Pharmacy", in order to increase the profitability OF the master's degree programme in the EP of MUK from the 2020-21 academic year, it was decided to pay teachers hourly in the disciplines of the WC. Accordingly, the academic load of the Master's degree programme is not included in the calculation of the staff.

During the visit to the MUK, the EEC held meetings with teaching staff engaged in the educational process in the magistracy.

The heads of the RWM of master's and master's dissertations are: Ph.D., Professor R.M. Abdullabekova, Ph.D., Associate Professor G.T. Murzalieva, Ph.D., Associate Professor i.v. Loseva, Ph.D. Zhabaeva A.N.

The head of the EP is Doctor of Pharmacy, Professor of the School of Pharmacy Abdullabekova Raisa Musulmanbekovna, who has experience in training undergraduates in the EP "Pharmacy", is the author of textbooks, the head and participant of national and international scientific projects. Leading teachers of the School of Pharmacy were involved in the process of creating, evaluating and improving the programme, external experts from potential employers - Candidate of Pharmacy A.N. Zhabayeva, Doctor of Pharmacy Kh.I. Itzhanova (employees of IR&PH Phytochemistry JSC) with practical, scientific and academic experience took part in the development and discussion of the EP.

All professors of specialized disciplines and heads of research institutes in the Ministry OF Education and Science meet the qualification requirements for scientific supervisors, and also continue to improve their academic, scientific and professional competencies through training in advanced training courses, master classes and seminars. NJSC MUK annually presents opportunities for advanced training both on the basis of the university and on the basis of other scientific and educational organizations, including foreign ones.

Within the framework of the master's programme, the following types of educational work are established for the teaching staff: 1) lectures; 2) practical classes/ seminars/laboratory work; 3) consultations; 4) independent work of the student under the guidance of a teacher; 8) professional practice (pedagogical, research); 9) management of the NIRM 10) conducting intermediate and final control.

In NJSC MUK, qualification requirements and job descriptions (job descriptions) have been developed for each position of employees of all divisions. Job descriptions are available for each employee, posted on the corporate portal. When hiring an employee, transferring to another position, he/she must definitely familiarize himself/herself with the job description and make a note in the familiarization sheet. The activities of each unit as a whole are regulated by the Regulations on the unit.

The teaching staff is responsible for improper performance of their duties provided for by the job description, within the limits determined by the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan; for the quality of educational, methodological, scientific processes at the School; for the quality of training of specialists.

Every year, at the beginning and end of the academic year, an assessment of staff satisfaction is carried out, which reflects the effectiveness of the university's personnel policy. The Administration and the Department of Human Resources Management of MUK NJSC have implemented the performance indicators "Training, preparation and retraining of personnel", developed and improves the incentive systems linked to the achievement of certain performance results by employees (additional payment for publications in high-rated publications, additional payment in the amount of 100% of the base salary for conducting classes in English with the certificate TOEFL and IELTS, for obtaining patents, etc.), within the payroll (due to savings in the payroll fund) for the relevant reporting period, the Company's employees can be paid a bonus in the following cases: based on the results of work for the year; national and state holidays; professional holidays; anniversary dates.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 7 standards: fully -6, partially -1, non-compliant -0

Standard 5: Implemented

#### Strengths:

1. Professionals of a high level are involved in the implementation of the Master's degree programme EP 7M10104 "Pharmacy".

2. The entire teaching staff of specialized disciplines and the heads of research of undergraduates meet the qualification requirements for scientific managers, systematically improve their academic,

ECAQA\_Евразийский центр аккредитации и обеспечения качества образования и здравоохранения 23

scientific and professional competencies through training in advanced training courses, master classes and seminars.

3. There are approved Job descriptions and qualification requirements for each position of the teaching staff.

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Strengthen the language competencies of teaching staff and students for wider integration into the international space.
- 2) Establish international cooperation, academic mobility of faculty and students in the master's degree programme.

#### Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES, SETTINGS AND SCHOLARSHIP Evidence of compliance:

The main implementation of the educational programme of the master's degree 7M10104 - "technology of pharmaceutical production" is carried out in classrooms, classes and educational and scientific laboratories of the School of Pharmacy (3 chemical laboratories, 1 specialized audience for pharmacological research, 1 - on the technology of drugs), in the collective use laboratory of NJSC MUK as well as on the educational bases of departments and schools involved in the educational process of this EP (biochemical, microbiological laboratories).

The equipment of the School of Pharmacy is intended for the study of medicinal plants, histological analysis of slices and microscopic characteristics of plants, obtaining extracts from plant raw materials using ultrasound, evaporation of residual solvents from plant extracts, establishment of the qualitative composition and quantitative content of biologically active substances, evaluation of antimicrobial and other types of biological activity of studied medicinal substances, manufacture of finished dosage forms, in the laboratory of organic synthesis, syntheses of organic drug compounds are carried out, including microwave activation conditions, the creation of 3D models of various medical products from polylactic acid is carried out, which is directly related to the scientific directions of master's and doctoral studies of students of the "Pharmacy" and "Pharmaceutical production technology".

The School of Pharmacy has the necessary office equipment: computers, laptops, printers, multimedia projectors, projection screens. In order to effectively conduct lectures and classes in a remote format, 3 video conferencing terminals on the Webex platform were purchased and installed at the school of pharmacy to ensure high quality of communication. This equipment can be used for high-quality predefense and defense of master's theses in online format.

To ensure a safe learning environment, all available laboratories, the training and clinical center used in the educational process and research activities under the educational programme have passports, safety instructions have been developed, logs are maintained to monitor compliance with safety rules by employees of the unit and students. Laboratory equipment is maintained in working order and undergoes appropriate calibration procedures.

The computer park of the library and publishing center consists of 113 computers, 88 of which are thin clients (TC). 21 personal computers (PCs) are located in the divisions of the library and publishing center, 4 PCs and 63 TVs - in the hall of electronic resources and 25 TVs - in the interactive hall, the entire fleet of computers is connected to the INTERNET. WiFi is available throughout the library and publishing centre. There are 2 scanners for users in the Electronic Resources Hall. The interactive hall is equipped with a short-focus projector. For doctoral students and faculty, there is a Research Fellow's Hall equipped with 15 computers connected to the Internet, which allows access to all information resources of the university.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant* with 4 of the standard: Fully -4 *Standard 6: Implemented* 

#### Strengths:

1. Continuous improvement of the material and technical base of the university and updating of library resources.

2. The possibility of conducting scientific research of undergraduates using the research base of external partners of the university within the framework of the existing Consortium "Pharmaceutical Cluster"

3. Good supply of ICT trainees and staff and library resources, free access of trainees and staff to all information systems.

4. Students are provided with a high level of resources (laboratories, scientific centers, collective laboratories, clinics) for research.

5. The Student Service Centre is organized and operates at a high level.

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

#### Standard 7: MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROCESS Evidence of compliance:

The EP underwent internal and external examination in accordance with the established procedure and was included in the national Register of educational programmes. In the process of developing the EP and monitoring educational activities, all stakeholders are involved, including students and employers, whose representatives are part of the School Council and the Quality Assurance Commission of the EP.

Master's degree programme 7M10104 "Pharmacy" was developed by the working group of NJSC "MUK", the expert was a representative of employers Itzhanova Kh.I. – Chief Researcher of JSC IR&PH "Phytochemistry"

The EP was discussed by the Academic Committee (hereinafter - AC) of the school, Minutes No.8 dated 09.04.2019, approved by the Academic Council (hereinafter - AC), Minutes No.6 dated 23.04.2019 and approved by the Academic Council No. 9 dated 25.04.2019.

Data collection for the analysis of EP is carried out through the analysis of students' performance based on the results of interim and final certification, questionnaires and interviews (with a small contingent) of students, teaching staff and employers on the satisfaction of EP, analysis of employment and career growth of programme graduates.

At the meetings of the Department and the School Council, information is systematically provided and issues on the progress of the implementation of the EP, possible problems and ways to eliminate them are discussed. Proposals for improving the EP are made by all stakeholders, discussed at the School Council/Department meeting.

The educational programme undergoes quality monitoring at least once every 3 years, in case of preparation for specialized accreditation of EP, quality monitoring is carried out unscheduled.

Specialized accreditation EP 7M10104 - "Pharmacy" was given in 2016. Based on the results, a plan for the implementation of the recommendations of the accreditation commission was developed, the reports on the implementation of which were submitted to the accreditation agency. Challenges in implementing the recommendations are discussed at the School Board.

For the last 2 years, the following disciplines were introduced in the CED for the Master's degree programme to select the Master's degree programme "Pharmacy": "Preclinical and clinical trials of medicinal products", "Intercultural professional communication", "Preparation of a master's study (Selection and formulation of a topical problem, study design)", "Pharmacogenomics", "Chromatographic methods in pharmaceutical studies", "Good pharmaceutical practices", "Microbiological methods in preclinical studies of medicinal products", which reflects the scientific and professional needs of future masters.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with8 standards: Fully -8 Standard 7: Implemented

#### Strengths:

1. Students and employers are members of the School Board and the Quality Assurance Commission of the EP and are widely involved in the development and monitoring of educational activities within the EP

2. At the EP level, quality assurance is carried out by the Quality Assurance Commission, at the institutional level, the Strategic Development and Quality Management Division is responsible for quality assurance.

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) To expand the partnership with the organizations of practical pharmacy for internships

#### **Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION**

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

The management and administration of the university control and monitor the entire educational process and the implementation of the EP through the analysis of anonymous questionnaires of faculty and students, the organization of external audit, ensuring all types of state control of the university, involving all stakeholders in the evaluation of the programme; create conditions for the organization, planning and implementation of educational programmes; determine the requirements for the level of training of students, the content of education, the maximum volume of the educational load of students in the NJSC "MUK" in accordance with the SRS of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The main structural unit that manages and implements the Pharmacy EP, as well as coordinates the work of other departments of schools involved in the implementation of the EP, is the School of Pharmacy.

All decisions taken at the level of the Management Board, Senate, dean's office (orders, orders, decisions) are communicated to interested parties in the form of mailings by corporate mail, posting on the corporate portal (links are also sent by mail), the most important documents are communicated to interested parties, responsible persons and executors, which is recorded in the familiarization lists.

The Master's degree programmes approved by the Master's degree programme were developed by the Head of the Master's degree programme and the working group of the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines and Chemistry in 2019. Further, the EP was presented for discussion at the meeting of the Department, the School Council (9.04.19, Minutes No.8), the Academic Council (23.04.19, Minutes No.6) and was approved at the meeting of the Academic Council (25.04.19, Minutes No.11).

The development of the EP and its updating is carried out in accordance with the Regulation on management of the educational programme MUK NJSC dated the in 09.09.2020.14(https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1-7KgBO0VNvTrlaJ1cWYul4Xfq1eRTFpK).

The dean, the head of the EP and the teaching staff are responsible for the organization and effectiveness of current performance monitoring and interim certification in the disciplines, carry out systematic monitoring of students' academic achievements and monthly certification.

The involvement of a wide range of stakeholders in the process of assessment and improvement of EP in the NJSC MUK is ensured by the participation of employers, representatives of the public, professional organizations, students of EP.

R.M. Abdullabekova, Professor of Pharmacy School, Doctor of Pharmacy, was appointed Head of the Master's Degree Programme 7M10104 "Pharmacy".

Sources of funding - budgetary and extra-budgetary (state educational order, income from the provision of paid educational services, research work and other works that do not contradict the law,

international funds, organizations, grants, etc.). The process of the university budget formation for the current year includes the determination of the income and expenditure base.

The university practices separate accounting of finances for educational programmes. The work of all administrative structures that ensure the management and implementation of EP is regulated by the University Development Plan, as well as the relevant procedures of the quality management system – regulations and job descriptions.

In accordance with the "Regulations on the management of the educational programme "NAO "MUK", the quality of the EP "Pharmacy" is provided by the participants in its implementation: the Dean of the School, the Head of the EP, the coordinators of the modules responsible for the discipline, heads of departments, teachers, students.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant* with 19 standards: fully -17, partially – 2. *Standard 8: Implemented* 

#### Strengths:

1. Established effective management system of the university;

2. During the formation and implementation of the EP, the faculty and administrative structures of the university have a high degree of academic freedom.

3. An education quality management system has been established and continuously improved, an effective system for monitoring the activities of the university, developed in accordance with the recommendations of international standards, is functioning

4. All internal stakeholders have free access to the regulatory documents regulating the educational process and internal documents through the Unified Information Network of MUK, the corporate SharePoint portal, and the student educational portal.

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

## Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

NJSC MUK determines and establishes mechanisms for periodic review, study and evaluation of the educational programmes being implemented and ensures the quality of their management process. The system of making changes to educational programmes is regulated in the "Regulations on the management of the educational programme".

If it is necessary to make changes to the EP less than 70%, a decision is made to update the EP. The basis for updating the EP can be: 1) the results of the evaluation of the quality of the EP; 2) objective changes in the conditions for the implementation of the EP (change in the regulatory framework).

The structure of the educational programme is based on the modular principle and contains key and professional competencies and learning outcomes. At the same time, the credits, competencies and training results are interrelated and based on the Dublin descriptors, taking into account the ECTS and the qualification framework of the NQF and the EHEA.

The main resource of the educational process is the teachers, therefore, the personnel potential, the teaching staff according to EP 7M10104- "Pharmacy" meets the qualification requirements, constant work is carried out to build and strengthen the personnel potential. The personnel policy is approved by the decision of the Management Board of MUK NJSC and reflects the main changes in the regulatory documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of labor legislation.

During the visit of the EEC, MUK NJSC demonstrated a sufficient material and technical base to ensure the high-quality implementation of educational programmes. Evidence of the continuous improvement and improvement of the material and technical base of "MUK" is the use in educational and scientific processes of updated resources of educational-scientific and research laboratories;

annual replenishment of the library's book fund in Kazakh, Russian and English; the introduction of innovative, information and communication technologies

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 4 standards: fully – 3, partially – 1. *Standard 9: Implemented* 

#### Strengths:

1. The mission and policies of the University are regularly reviewed according to the changing needs of the society

2. Continuous improvement of logistics, staffing and other resources on a planned basis

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Due to the need of the society to attract more applicants for training, including at the expense of own funds of students

# 6. Recommendations for improving the Master's degree programme 7M110104 - "Pharmacy":

1. To conclude contracts with multidisciplinary clinics, production bases, etc. for the organization of internship for undergraduates of EP 7M10104 – "Pharmacy".

2. Increase academic mobility of undergraduates, opportunities for publications and participation in international conferences and forums.

3. In the course of the implementation of the EP for the formative assessment of undergraduates, introduce the portfolio method.

4. Strengthen the language competencies of teaching staff and students for wider integration into the international space.

5. Establish international cooperation, academic mobility of faculty and students in the master's degree programme.

6. To expand the partnership with the organizations of practical pharmacy for internships

7. Due to the need of the society to attract more applicants for training, including at the expense of own funds of students

#### 7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The members of the EEC established the compliance of the educational programme of the Master's degree 7M110104 - "Pharmacy" with the accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this programme for a period of 5 years.

	Full name
chairperson	KAUYSHEVA ALMAGUL
	AMANGELDINOVNA
Foreign Expert	RAKHIMOV BAHODIR
	BAHTIYOR SHULLI
Academic Expert	OSTENOVA GULBARAM
	OMARGAZIEVA
Academic Expert	TULEUTAEVA RAYKHAN
	ESENZHANOVNA
Employers'	EKATERINA KAMYLEVNA
representative	PAVLOVA
Representative of	MAHMOUD NAZERKE
undergraduates	SAIDUALIKYZY
-	

Observer for ECAQA - M.A. Umarova

#### Attachment 1.

r	(generalization)					
			E	stimation		
Standard	Evaluation Criteria	Number of standards	Fully compliant BS*/SI	Partially compliant BS*/SI	Not compliant	
1	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	5	5			
2	EDUCATIONAL PROCESS	21	18	1/2		
3	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENT LEARNING	10	9	1		
4	STUDENTS	12	12			
5	STAFFING	7	6	1		
6	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES, SETTINGS	4	4			
	AND SCHOLARSHIP					
7	MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF THE	8	8			
	EDUCATIONAL PROCESS					
8	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	19	17	2		
9	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	4	3/0	1		
	Total:	90	82/0	6/2		
				90		

Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme (generalization)

#### Attachment 2.

# List of documents studied by the members of the EEC within the framework of accreditation accreditation of the EP of the Master's degree programme

N⁰	Names of documents	Quantity	Date of approval
1	Educational programme 7M10104 – "Pharmacy"	1	25.04.2019
2	Master's thesis defense scorecard EP 7M10104 - Pharmacy:	1	
3	Attachment to the syllabus of the discipline "Pharmaceutical Management"	1	
4	Report of the Bioethics Committee for 2019	1	
5	Essay topics on the discipline "History and Philosophy of Science"	1	
6	Attachment 2 Approximate topics of the essay for the final control in the discipline "Pedagogy of higher education"	1	
7	Essay topics on the discipline "History and Philosophy of Science"	1	
8	Attachment 2 Approximate topics of the essay for the final control in the discipline "Pedagogy of higher education"	1	
9	The contract of the international project Erasmus+ "SPRING".	1	
10	Information on internal quality monitoring of EP NJSC MUK.	1	
11	List of projects performed on the basis of paintwork 2021-2022	1	
12	Regulation on the Committee on Bioethics of NJSC MUK.	1	
13	Pharmacy report after review by EEC	1	
14	The contract of the international project Erasmus+ "SPRING".	1	
15	Regulations on the magistracy	1	11.01.2021
16	REGULATION ON THE MANAGEMENT OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME IN NJSC "MUK"	1	09.09.2020